

## Editor's Note

*Alexander Filippov*

Professor of Sociology, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
E-mail: filippovaf@gmail.com

# The 17th-Century Political Cartesianism and Its Opponents, or, Imaging the State from Point Fixe

*Julia Ivanova*

Leading Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
 20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
 E-mail: juliaivanova@list.ru

*Pavel Sokolov*

Lecturer, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
 20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
 E-mail: alharizi@rambler.ru

The paper focuses upon two samples of early modern “civil sciences”: rhetorical inquiry dealing with contingency (so called “rhetorica primaria”) and mathesis politica traditionally referring to the intellectual context of early Enlightenment. The study deals with the main tendencies that shaped early Enlightenment political science consisting of criticism of the necessitarian ethical rhetorical paradigm, an appeal to rhetorical competence, search for a way to “tame” contingency and thus to learn how to understand the human will’s universe of effects and how to control it. Special attention is paid to the famous “new sciences”: Giambattista Vico’s *scienza nuova* and Thomas Hobbes *scientia civilis*. The fundamental difference in Vico’s and Hobbes’ theoretical styles is emphasized. While Hobbs is “macro-sociological” (“macro-solution of macro-problems”) and handles issues extreme and ultimate, that allow neither interim decisions nor close attention to historical niceties, Vico considers the matter of his science as a universe of contingency, defining *scienza nuova* as history. Particular attention is paid to the function of the topical-rhetorical discourse in Hobbes’ political science, used for the description of the prepolitical man (6th chapter of *Leviathan*). Drawing upon almost unknown 17th-century Dutch political writings, the study examines ways of the reception of Hobbes’ civil science conceived as a rhetorical inquiry. The authors also explore Vico’s alternative to Hobbes’ constructionist theoretical style. A vast array of contemporary theoretical approaches to the early modern political thought is analyzed, from the “Cambridge history of concepts” to N.S. Struever’s “modal rhetoric”.

*Keywords:* state, politics, conceptual history, metaphorology, Christianity, universalism, republicanism

## References

- Cahnman W.J. (1995) *Weber and Toennies: Comparative Sociology in Historical Perspective*, New Brunswick: Transaction.
- Daniel S.H. (1984) *John Toland: His Methods, Manners and Mind*, Kingston, Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press.
- Battistini A. (1973) Tradizione e innovazione nella tassonomia tropologica vichiana. *Bulletino del Centro di Studi Vichiani*, vol. 3, pp. 67–81.
- De la Court J. (1662) *Politike discoursen handelende in ses onderscheide boeken van Staden, Landen, Oorlogen, Kerken, Regeringen en Zeeden. Het Sesde Boek*, Amsterdam: Pieter Hackius.
- Gadamer H.-G. (1988) *Istina i metod: osnovy filosofskoj germenevtiki* [Truth and Method: Foundations of a Philosophical Hermeneutics], Moscow: Progress.
- Girard P. (2008) *Giambattista Vico: rationality et politique. Une lecture de la Scienza nuova*, Paris: Presses de l’Université Paris-Sorbonne.
- Goetsch J.R. (1995) *Vico’s Axioms: The Geometry of the Human World*, New Haven: Yale

- University Press.
- Hintikka J. (1981) Gaps in the great chain of being: an exercise in the methodology of the history of ideas. *Reforging the Great Chain of Being: Studies in the History of Modal Theories* (ed. S. Knuuttila), Dordrecht: D. Reidel, pp. 1–17.
- Hobbes C. (2002) *Rhetoric on the Margins of Modernity: Vico, Condillac, Monoboddo*, Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.
- Hobbes T. (1839) De homine. *Opera philosophica quae latine scripsit omnia*, Vol. 2, London: Apud Johannem Bohn, pp. 1–132.
- Hobbes T. (1840) *English Works*, Vol. 4, London: John Bohn.
- Hobbes T. (1989) O cheloveke [Concerning Man]. *Sochinenija*, T. 1 [Collected Works, Vol. 1], Moscow: Nauka, pp. 219–269.
- Hobbes T. (1991) Leviathan, ili Materija, forma i vlast' gosudarstva cerkovnogo i grazhdanskogo [Leviathan or The Matter, Forme and Power of a Common Wealth Ecclesiastical and Civil]. *Sochinenija*, T. 2 [Collected Works, Vol. 2], Moscow: Nauka, pp. 3–545.
- Leijenhorst C. (2002) *The Mechanization of Aristotelianism: The Late Aristotelian Setting of Thomas Hobbes' Natural Philosophy*, Leiden: Brill.
- Meinecke F. (2004) *Vozniknovenie istorizma* [The Rise of Historicism], Moscow: ROSSPEN.
- Neocleus M. (2003) *Imagining the State*, Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- Parkin J. (2003) Taming the Leviathan: reading Hobbes in seventeenth-century Europe. *Early Modern Natural Law Theories: Contexts and Strategies in the Early Enlightenment* (eds. T.J. Hochstrasser, P. Schroder), Dordrecht: Kluwer, pp. 31–52.
- Paschius G. (1700) *De novis inventis, quorum accuratiori cultui fecem praetulit antiquitas*, Lipsiae: Sumptibus Haeredum Joh. Grossi.
- Pique N. (2010) Du texte à l'origine du texte: la querelle entre Richard Simon et Jean Le Clerc. *Philologie als Wissenschaft / La philologie comme modèle de savoir* (eds. D. Thouard, F. Vollhardt, F.M. Zini), Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, pp. 285–308.
- Rothkamm J. (2009) *Institutio Oratoria: Bacon, Descartes, Hobbes, Spinoza*, Leiden: Brill.
- Schmitt C. (1963) *Der Begriff des politischen*, Berlin: Duncker & Humblot.
- Schoneveld C.W. (1996) *Sea-changes: Studies in Three Centuries of Anglo-Dutch Cultural Transmission*, Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Skinner Q. (1979) *Foundations of Modern Political Thought*, Vol. 1: *The Renaissance*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skinner Q. (2004) *The Vision of Politics*, Vol. 3: *Hobbes and Civil Science*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skinner Q., Zarka Y.Ch. (2001) *Hobbes: The Amsterdam Debate*, Hildesheim, Zurich, New York: Georg Olms.
- Struever N.S. (1999) Dilthey's Hobbes and Cicero's rhetoric. *Rhetorica Movet: Studies in Historical and Modern Rhetoric in Honour of Heinrich F. Plett* (eds. P.L. Oesterreich, T.O. Sloane), Leiden: Brill, pp. 233–261.
- Struever N.S. (2009) *Rhetoric, Modality, Modernity*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Tosel A. (2005) La "Science nouvelle" de Vico face à la "mathesis universalis". *Noesis* (electronic journal), no 8. Available at: <http://noesis.revues.org/120> (accessed 10 January 2010).
- Vdovina G. (2009) *Jazyk neochevidnogo: uchenija o znakah v sholastike XVII veka* [The Language of Unobvious: The Doctrine of Signs in the Scholasticism of the 17th Century], Moscow: Institut filosofii, teologii i istorii sv. Fomы.
- Vico G. (1994) *Osnovanija novoj nauki ob obshhej prirode nacij* [Principles of New Science about the Common Nature of Nations], Moscow, Kiev: REFL-book, ISA.
- Vico G. (1999) *Vita scritta da se medesimo*, Milano: Arnaldo Mondadori.
- Vico G. (2005) *De antiquissima italorum sapientia*, Roma: Edizioni di storia e letteratura.

Wassenaer G. van (1657) *Bedeekte konsten in regeringen en heerschappien die bykans gebryuckt worden, en waer door Koningen en Princen, Edelen en Steden, die het hoogste gebiedt hebben, haer Staedt en Heerschappie vast stellen*, Utrecht: By Gysbert van Zyll, en Dirck van Ackersdick.

Zarka Y.Ch. (1999) *La decision metaphysique de Hobbes: conditions de la politique*, Paris: Vrin.

## Russian Atlantis

*Andrey Teslya*

Assistant Professor, Pacific National University  
136 Tihookeanskaya Str., Khabarovsk, Russian Federation 680035  
E-mail: mestr81@gmail.com

## "There Is No Chance to Understand What Russia Wants": Slavophile Press and Serbia in 1880s

*Alexander Kotov*

Assistant Professor, Saint-Petersburg Institute of Education in the Sphere of Humanities and Social Sciences  
4 Lifyndskaja Str., Saint-Petersburg, Russian Federation 190020  
Email: akotov@inbox.ru

The article investigates the Russian-Serbian relations at the end of 19th century as represented in the periodical press and in the correspondence of Russian and Serbian public figures. There was no Parliament in Russia in 1860s so the periodical press was both the arena for public discussion and was used to consolidate the different political movements. Sometimes the society used it to influence the government's decisions. Russian publicists knew about the Balkan Slavs periodical press interest in the Russian press and tried to convince the Slavs to follow the Russian strategy. Serbian question was discussed at the pages of different Russian journals, both socialist and conservative. The ambiguity of Russian-Serbian relations was confirmed even by Slavophiles, who noted various miscalculation of the Russian state and public figures on the Balkans. Sometimes this criticism was connected with ideological differences between Russian publicists. However, all of them considered St.Petersburg's bureaucracy the main source of Russian problems. But sometimes the problem was incompatibility between Russian and Serbian interests. Russian conservatives found allies in Serbian radicals. The Slavophiles's democratism was represented in the texts of P.A. Kulakovskiy, I.S. Aksakov, and N.P. Gilyarov-Platonov. In general, the Slavic question in Russia was connected with domestic Russian politics. The development of democratization of Russian society was objectively connected with increasing nationalism making the Serbian question a part of the quest of national ideology. Slavophiles were not so much interested in the Slavic population per se, but rather how to use them as an instrument of national consolidation.

*Keywords:* Slavophilism, conservatism, Serbia, Balkans, Ivan Aksakov, Gilyarov-Platonov, Leontiev, Pasic

### References

- Aksakov I. (1896) *Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov v ego pis'mah, Ch. 2, T. 4* [The Correspondence of Ivan Sergeyevich Aksakov, Part 2, Vol. 4], Saint-Petersburg: Imperatorskaja publichnaja biblioteka.
- Alexeev A., Viktorovich V., Prokhorov G. (eds.) (2007) *Vozvrashhenie N.P. Gilyarova-Platonova* [The Return of N.P. Gilyarov-Platonov], Kolomna: KGPI.
- Anonymous (1885) K voprosu o polozhenii serbskoj Cerkvi [Toward the Question of the State of Serbian Church]. *Izvestija S.-Peterburgskogo slavjanskogo blagotvoritel'nogo obshhestva*, no 1.
- Danchenko S. (1989) *Russko-serbskie obshhestvennye svjazi, 70–80-e gg. XIX v.* [Russian-Serbian Public Relations, 1870–1880s], Moscow: Nauka.
- Dostoyevsky F. (1995) *Sobranie sochinenij, T. 14* [Collected Works, Vol. 14], Saint-Petersburg: Nauka.
- Durnovo N. (1890) *Gosudarstva i narody Balkanskogo poluostrova: ih proshdeshee, nastojashhee i budushhee i Bolgarskaja krivda* [States and Nations of Balkan Peninsula: Their Past, Present and Future and the Bulgarian Falsehood], Moscow: Tipographia Lessenera i Romana.
- Gellner E. (1991) *Nacii i nacionalizm* [Nations and Nationalism], Moscow: Progress.
- Golovin K. (n.d.) *Moi vospominanija za 35 let* [My Memoirs for 35 Years], Saint-Petersburg:

- M.O. Volf.
- Gringmut V. (1890) *Nashi brat'ja* [Our Brothers]. *Russkoe obozrenie*, no 7.
- Gringmut V. (1891) *Serbskie skandaly* [Serbian Scandals]. *Russkoe obozrenie*, no 3.
- Hevrolina V. (1999) *Vlast' i obshhestvo: bor'ba v Rossii po voprosam vneshnej politiki, 1878–1894 gg.* [Power and Society: The Struggle in Russia on Issues of Foreign Policy, 1878–1894], Moscow: Institut rossijkoj istorii.
- Kloppenburg A. (1894) *Stranica iz istorii vostochnogo voprosa* [A Page from the History of Eastern Question]. *Russkoe obozrenie*, no 1.
- Kulakovskiy P. (1883) *Serbia v poslednie gody* [Serbia in Recent Years]. *Russkij vestnik*, vol. 164, pp. 738–765.
- Lapteva L. (1998) *Slavjanskij vopros v mirovozzrenii P.A. Kulakovskogo (po arhivnym materialam)* [A Slavic Question in the Worldview of P.A. Kulakovskiy (Based on Archive Materials)]. *Slavjanskaja ideja: istorija i sovremennost'* [Slavic Idea: History and the Present], Moscow: ISB, pp. 111–125.
- Leontiev K. (1996) *Plody nacional'nyh dvizhenij na pravoslavnym Vostoke* [The Fruits of National Movements in the Orthodox East]. *Vostok, Rossija i Slavjanstvo* [East, Russia and Slavdom], Moscow: Respublika, pp. 534–566.
- Meshchersky V. (1877) *Pravda o Serbii* [The Truth about Serbia], Saint-Petersburg: Tipografija Obolenskogo.
- Meshchersky V. (2003) *Vospominanija* [Memoirs], Moscow: Zaharov.
- Nevedensky S. (1888) *N. Katkov i ego vremja* [N. Katkov and His Time], Saint-Petersburg: Tipographia A.S. Suvorina.
- Parkhomenko D. (2008) *Vneshnopoliticheskie aspekty processa modernizacii Serbii 80-h gg. XIX v.* [Foreign Policy Aspects of the Process of Modernization in Serbia of the 1880s] (Candidate of Sciences Thesis), Kazan: Kazan State University.
- Pobedonostsev K. (1925) *Pis'ma K.P. Pobedonostsev k Aleksandru III, T. 1* [Letters of K.P. Pobedonostsev to Alexander III, Vol. 1], Moscow: Novaja Moskva.
- Sharapov S. (1903) *Neopoznannyj genij* [Unrecognized Genius], Moscow: Tipografija A.V. Vasilieva.
- Sharyy A., Shimov Y. (2011) *Korni i korona: ocherki ob Avstro-Vengrii* [Roots and Crown: Studies of Austria-Hungary], Moscow: Kolibri.
- Shemyakin A. (1994) "Obzor dejatel'nosti serbskoj oppozicii". Zapiska N. Pasica direktoru Aziatskogo departamenta MID Rossii I.A. Zinovievu, 1887 ["An Overview of Serbian Opposition Activities". A Report of N. Pasic to the Head of Asian Department of the Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs I.A. Zinoviev, 1887]. *Istoricheskij arhiv*, no 5, pp. 108–135.
- Shemyakin A. (1997) *Serbskij mitropolit Mihail: gody izgnanija (1883–1889)* [Mikhail, the Metropolitan of Serbia: Years of Exile]. *Cerkov' v istorii slavjanskih narodov* [The Church in the History of Slavic Nations], Moscow: Institut slavjanovedenija i balkanistiki, pp. 259–273.
- Shemyakin A. (1998) *Ideologija Nikoly Pashicha: formirovanie i jevoljucija (1868–1891)* [The Ideology of Nikola Pasic: The Shaping and Evolution (1868–1891)], Moscow: Indrik.
- Shemyakin A. (2003) *Mitropolit Mihail v jemigracii (vmeste s Nikoloj Pashichem protiv Milana Obrenovicha)* [Metropolitan Mikhail in Exile (with Nikola Pasic against Milan Obrenovic)]. *Slavjanskij al'manah*, vol. 7, pp. 112–129.
- Shemyakin A. (2006) *General M.G. Chernyaev i Serbskaja vojna* [General M.G. Chernyaev and Serbian War]. *Tokovi istorije*, no 1–2, pp. 7–28.
- Shemyakin A. (2010) *Ideologija serbskogo radikalizma (1885–1903 gg.): istoriograficheskie stereotipy i dilemmy* [The Ideology of Serbian Radicalism (1885–1903): Historiographic

- Stereotypes and Dilemmas]. *Rossija i Serbija glazami istorikov dvuh stran* [Russia and Serbia through the Eyes of the Historians of Two Countries], Saint-Petersburg: Aletheia, pp. 143–164.
- Strakhov I., Sokolov I. (eds.) (1883) *Izvestija S.-Peterburgskogo slavjanskogo blagotvoritel'nogo obshhestva* [Bulletin of St. Petersburg Slavic Benevolent Society], no 1.
- Strakhov I., Sokolov I. (eds.) (1884) *Izvestija S.-Peterburgskogo slavjanskogo blagotvoritel'nogo obshhestva* [Bulletin of St. Petersburg Slavic Benevolent Society], no 8.
- Teplov V. (1882) Greko-bolgarskij cerkovnyj vopros po neizdannym istochnikam [Greek-Bulgarian Church Question According to the Unpublished Sources]. *Russkij vestnik*, vol. 159, pp. 379–444.

# The Censored Sixth Article by Ivan Aksakov from the Series “On the Mutual Relationship Between People, Society and State”

*Andrey Teslya*

Assistant Professor, Pacific National University  
136 Tihookeanskaya Str., Khabarovsk, Russian Federation 680035  
E-mail: mestr81@gmail.com

Two previously censored versions of the sixth article from I.S. Aksakov's series “On the mutual relation of the people, society and the state” are published for the first time. They were devoted to the history of zemstvo, its relationship with the state in the era from Ivan IV to Peter I. The series was published in the 1862 in the journal “The Day” that he edited and published. However, publication was interrupted for censorship reasons, which we explain in an introductory article. The unpublished article which is part of a series, is of considerable interest for understanding the ideas of Aksakov. In 1861–1862 Aksakov, together with Yury Samarin, modified Konstantin Aksakov's “Territory” and “State” doctrine (created at the end of the 1840–1850s). I. Aksakov and Y. Samarin emphasized subjectivity, formulating the doctrine of “society”, “people” and “state” where the “people” and “state” are considered similarly to the doctrine of Konstantin Aksakov. People “in close and more strict sense” are understood as “the common people, that is a lot of the people that live life right,” and the state acts as “the external definition given to itself by the people; its activity, i.e. the states, and the area of its activity are purely external”. The essential novelty consists in the introduced concepts of society defined in Hegelian ambiance as “the people on the second stage of its development, the people self-conscious”.

Keywords: state, people, society, Slavophilism, zemstvo, Aksakov

## References

- Aksakov I. (1887) *Sochinenija*, T. 5 [Works, Vol. 5], Moscow: Tipografija M.G. Volchaninova.
- Aksakov I. (1891) *Sochinenija*, T. 2 [Works, Vol. 2], Saint-Petersburg: Tipografija A.S. Suvorina.
- Aksakov I. (1892) *Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov v ego pis'mah*, T. 3 [The Correspondence of Ivan Sergeyevich Aksakov, Vol. 3], Moscow: Tipografija M.G. Volchaninova.
- Aksakov I. (1896) *Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov v ego pis'mah*, Ch. 2, T. 4 [The Correspondence of Ivan Sergeyevich Aksakov, Part 2, Vol. 4], Saint-Petersburg: Imperatorskaja publichnaja biblioteka.
- Aksakov I. (2002) *Otchego tak nelegko zhivetsja v Rossii?* [Why Is Life in Russia So Hard?], Moscow: ROSSPEN.
- Aksakova V. (2004) *Dnevnik: 1854–1855 gg.* [The Diary: 1954–1855], Moscow: AST, Astrel.
- Badalyan D. (2011) *Cikl statej I.S. Aksakova ob obshhestve: istorija cenzury i neopublikovannye stranicy* [Series of I.S. Aksakov's Articles on Society: The History of Censorship and Unpublished Pages]. Proceedings of the *Third Readings from Aksakov*, 21–24 September 2011, Ulyanovsk, Russia, pp. 103–113.
- Chicherin B. (2010) *Vospominanija*, T. 2 [Memoirs, Vol. 2], Moscow: Izdatelstvo im. Sabashnikovyh.
- Lukashevich S. (1965) *Ivan Aksakov, 1823–1886: A Study in Russian Thought and Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Motin S. (ed.) (2012) *Aksakov Ivan Sergeevich: materialy dlja letopisi zhizni i tvorchestva*, Vyp. 4, Ch. 1 [Ivan Sergeyevich Aksakov: Materials for the Chronicle of Life and Work, Issue 4,

- Part 1], Ufa: UYI MVD Rossii.
- Tsimbaev N. (1978) *I.S. Aksakov v obshhestvennoj zhizni poreformennoj Rossii* [I.S. Aksakov in the Public Life of Post-Reform Russia], Moscow: MGU.
- Tsimbaev N. (1986) *Slavjanofil'stvo: iz istorii russkoj obshhestvenno-politicheskoy mysli XIX veka* [Slavophilism: From the History of Russian Social-Political Thought of the 19th Century], Moscow: MGU.
- Tsimbaev N. (2007) *Istoriosofija na razvalinah imperii* [Historiosophy at the Ruins of Empire], Moscow: MUM.
- Walicki A. (2012) *Filosofija prava russkogo liberalizma* [Legal Philosophies of Russian Liberalism], Moscow: Mysl.
- Wortman R.S. (2004) *Scenarii vlasti: mify i ceremonii russkoj monarhii, T. 2* [Scenarios of Power: Myths and Ceremonies of Russian Monarchy, Vol. 2], Moscow: OGI.

## Glossarium

*Carl Schmitt*

*Yuri Korinets*  
(translator)

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
E-mail: korinetz7@mail.ru

Carl Schmitt kept diaries throughout his life, several of which he specifically selected for academic publication. These are the recordings made in the early years after World War II, when Schmitt lost all his positions. After his release from the prison he returned to his home in small town of Plettenberg, where he remained until his death. Schmitt ordered these diaries to be published only after his death, because, even several decades after the war, they remained ideologically dangerous. In this issue we continue to publish fragments of translation of the "Glossarium". In the fragments prepared for present publication, Schmitt argues on several important topics. First, he discusses the position of intellectual in modern society. Schmitt argues with Julien Benda, the author of a book about the betrayal of intellectuals (*Trahison des clercs*). Schmitt also reflects on his own political fortunes. After the war, many colleagues accused him of collaboration with the Nazis which seemed unfair to him. The figure of the conservative Catholic poet of the middle 19th century Annette von Droste-Hulshoff appears in his writings. Schmitt also writes about Leon Bloy, a Catholic thinker whose writings preoccupied his attention, especially Bloy's famous diaries. Schmitt criticized the newer editions of his works. Schmitt agrees with conception of institute of Maurice Hauriou. Finally, he addresses a number of fundamental facts of political theology in connection to the basic distinctions drawn in his *Concept of the Political*, especially the distinction between friend and foe.

*Keywords:* Schmitt, political theology, intellectuals, enemy, Bloy, Hauriou

## Two Worlds of Action: Social Science, Social Theory and Systems of Sociological Refraction

*Phil Hutchinson*

Senior Lecturer in Philosophy, Manchester Metropolitan University,  
DIS, MMU Cheshire, Crewe Green Road, Crewe, UK CW1 5DU  
Email: p.hutchinson@mmu.ac.uk

*Andrei Korbut*  
(translator)

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
E-mail: korbut.andrei@gmail.com

*Ekaterina Pavlenko*  
(translator)

Junior Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
E-mail: korbut.andrei@gmail.com

Despite many points of divergence, social scientists and social theorists seem united by one primary concern: to identify what it is people are doing (or sometimes merely the negative of this, to expose that people are not doing what they took themselves to be doing, or that their peers or ancestors are not doing what folk had took them to have been doing). The thought that this might count as not only a viable but centrally important concern is grounded in a scepticism about the ability of societies' ordinary members to reliably correctly identify their own and others' actions. In this scepticism, such social scientists and social theorists usually situate themselves in opposition to ethnomethodologists and Peter Winch. This scepticism is grounded in a belief that ordinary or competent members of societies are unreliable authorities on the identity of their own and others' actions because they are subject to *systems of sociological refraction*. The idea being that ordinary members of society are systematically misled as to the identity of their actions and those of their peers because they — or their perceptions of actions — are subject to the refractive properties of (for example) ideology, or folk theories of action, and so on. In this paper, I subject to analysis this core commitment of much social science and social theory.

*Keywords:* sociology, sociological refraction, social theory, social action, sociobiology, ideology critique

## References

- Delanty G. (1997) *Social Science: Beyond Constructivism and Realism*, Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Ebersole F. (2001) Where the action is. *Things We Know: Fifteen Essays in the Problem of Knowledge*, Philadelphia: Xlibris, pp. 356–380.
- Feyerabend P. (2007) *Protiv metoda: ocherk anarchistskoj teorii poznaniya* [Against Method: Outline of an Anarchistic Theory of Knowledge], Moscow: AST.
- Geras N. (1995) Language, truth and justice. *New Left Review*, no 209, pp. 110–135.
- Griffiths P.E. (1997) *What Emotions Really Are: The Problem of Psychological Categories*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Hutchinson P. (2008) *Shame and Philosophy: An Investigation in the Philosophy of Emotions and Ethics*, Basingstoke: Palgrave.

- Hutchinson P. (2010) Thinking and understanding. *Wittgenstein: Key Concepts* (ed. K.D. Jolley), London: Acumen.
- Steiner H. (1994) *An Essay on Rights*, Oxford: Blackwell.

# Narrative Identity as a Theory of Practical Subjectivity: An Essay on Reconstruction of Paul Ricoeur's Theory

*Jean-Marc Tétaz*

Independent Researcher

Lausanne, Switzerland

E-mail: jean-marc.tetaz@bluewin.ch

*Michail Maiatsky*

(translator)

Professor of Philosophy, National Research University Higher School of Economics

20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000

E-mail: mmaiatsky@gmail.com

The concept of personal identity is one of the most sensitive questions in Paul Ricoeur's oeuvre. In this article we show what makes originality of Ricoeur's conception of narrative identity by analyzing the way it is presented in *Oneself as Another* and by pointing out the difference between the ricoeurian concept and the concept of narrative identity, introduced by Alasdair MacIntyre. For this reason we would like to focus on the analysis of configuration and refiguration, studied by Ricoeur in his oeuvre *Time and Narrative*. We would also include the notion of narrative identity into the conception of hermeneutics and demonstrate that the originality of the ricoerian concept is based on the possibilities offered by the theory of narration explicated in the debates with structuralism and literary theory. This sets the issue of subjectivity (self), in which the problematic of narrative identity is inscribed. This "philosophy of the first person" makes the key object of the second part of the research. The article shows how the self applies the narrative intrigue to his/her own life by identifying him(her)self with a storyteller or with a character. A reader or a storyteller constructs his/her narrative identity so that the process of self-understanding becomes possible.

*Keywords:* personal identity, narrative identity, reading, hermeneutics, subjectivity, poetics, theory of action

## References

- Anscombe G.E.M. (2002) *L'intention*, Paris: Gallimard.
- Austin J.L. (1994) "Pouvoir" et "si". *Écrits philosophiques*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 171–205.
- Berlin I. (1953) *The Hedgehog and the Fox: An Essay on Tolstoy's View of History*, London: Orion.
- Berlin I. (1978) *Russian Thinker*, London: Hogarth Press.
- Dagonet F. (1973) *Ecriture et iconographie*, Paris: Vrin.
- Davidson D. (1993) Actions, raisons et causes. *Actions et evenements*, Paris: PUF, pp. 15–36.
- Descombes V. (2004) *Le complément de sujet: enquête sur le fait d'agir de soi-même*, Paris: Gallimard.
- Descombes V. (2007) Une philosophie de la première personne. *Cahiers de l'Herne: Ricœur*, Vol. 2 (eds. M. Revault d'Allones, F. Azouvi), Paris: Seuil, pp. 72–92.
- Heidegger M. (1927) *Sein und Zeit*, Halle: Max Niemeyer.
- Locke J. (1975) *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Locke J. (1998) *Identité et différence: l'invention de la conscience*, Paris: Seuil.
- Loriga S. (2010) *Le petit x: de la biographie à l'histoire*, Paris: Seuil.
- MacIntyre A. (1981) *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory*, London: Duckworth.
- Parfit D. (1986) *Reasons and Persons*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Perry J. (ed.) (1999) *Personal Identity*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Quante M. (ed.) (1999) *Personale Identität*, Paderborn: Schöningh.
- Quante M. (2001) Menschliche Persistanz. *Person: Philosophiegeschichte — Theoretische Philosophie — Praktische Philosophie* (ed. D. Sturma), Paderborn: Mentis, pp. 223–258.
- Ricoeur P. (1975) *La métaphore vive*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (1983) *Temps et récit, Vol. 1: L'intrigue et le récit historique*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (1984) *Temps et récit, Vol. 2: La configuration dans le récit de fiction*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (1985) *Temps et récit, Vol. 3: Le temps raconte*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) De l'interprétation. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 11–38.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) L'effet hermeneutique de la distanciation. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 101–118.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) Qu'est-ce qu'un texte?. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 137–159.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) Expliquer et comprendre. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 161–182.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) Le modèle du texte: l'action sensée considérée comme un texte. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 183–211.
- Ricoeur P. (1986) L'imagination dans le discours et dans l'action. *Du texte à l'action. Essais d'hermeneutique II*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 213–236.
- Ricoeur P. (1987) Individu et identité personnelle. *Sur l'individu*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 54–73.
- Ricoeur P. (1988). L'identité narrative. *Esprit*. 1988, no 7–8. P. 295–304.
- Ricoeur P. (1988) La symbolique du mal. *Philosophie de la volonté*, Vol. 2: *Finitude et culpabilité*, Paris: Aubier, pp. 197–488.
- Ricoeur P. (1988) *Philosophie de la volonté*, Vol. 1: *Le volontaire et l'involontaire*, Paris: Aubier.
- Ricoeur P. (1988) *Philosophie de la volonté*, Vol. 2: *Finitude et culpabilité*, Paris: Aubier.
- Ricoeur P. (1990) *Soi-même comme un autre*, Paris: Seuil.
- Ricoeur P. (2004). L'originaire et la question-en-retour dans la Krisis de Husserl. *A l'école de la phénoménologie*, Paris: Vrin, pp. 361–378.
- Rorty A.O. (ed.) (1976) *The Identities of Persons*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Rorty R. (1989) *Contingency, Irony and Solidarity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Schleiermacher F. (2011) Conférences sur l'esthétique. *Conférences sur l'éthique, la politique et l'esthétique, 1814–1833*, Genève: Labor et Fides, pp. 409–448.
- Shoemaker S. (1963) *Self-knowledge and Self-identity*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Taylor Ch. (1989) *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tetaz J.-M. (2011) Présentation. Schleiermacher F. *Conférences sur l'éthique, la politique et l'esthétique, 1814–1833*, Genève: Labor et Fides, pp. 389–406.
- Thiel U. (2001) Person und persönliche Identität in der Philosophie des 17. und 18. Jahrhunderts. *Person: Philosophiegeschichte — Theoretische Philosophie — Praktische Philosophie* (ed. D. Sturma), Paderborn: Mentis, pp. 79–102.
- Thoma D. (2007) *Erzähle dich selbst: Lebensgeschichte als philosophisches Problem*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Tugendhat E. (2010) *L'homme egocentre et la mystique: une étude anthropologique*, Paris: Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme.
- Williams B. (1973) *Problems of the Self*, London: Cambridge University Press.
- Williams B. (1978) *Probleme des Selbst: Philosophische Aufsätze, 1956–1972*, Stuttgart: Reclam.

## Cultural Sociology Against the Pharaoh: The “Performative Revolution” in Egypt

*Alexei Titkov*

Assistant Professor, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration  
82 Prospect Vernadskogo, Moscow, Russian Federation 119571  
E-mail: a-titkov@yandex.ru

Review of *Performative Revolution in Egypt: An Essay in Cultural Power* by Jeffrey Alexander  
(London: Blumsbury Academic, 2012).

# Social Identity: Rational Choice Theory as an Alternative Approach to Conceptualization

*Dmitry Davydov*

Research Fellow, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Ural Branch of Russian Academy of Sciences  
 16 Sofia Kovalevskaya Str., Ekaterinburg, Russian Federation 620990  
 E-mail: davydovdmitriy90@gmail.com

The paper analyzes the theory of social identity. The role the individuals' intentions play in the processes of social identities construction is considered. The article shows the potential of rational choice theory as an alternative approach to the social identity conceptualization. The lack of existing theories, in the author's opinion, is in the absence of description and analysis of identity-choosing processes. The prevailing view is that social identity is formed unconsciously and by pressure of structural factors. The paper suggests that sociological rational choice theory can replace psychological theories which pay more attention to the individual level processes. In rational choice theory identity is understood as a matter of choice and a source of pleasure. Thus in rational choice theory, identity is still considered as a social phenomenon. It influences the individual's behavior, but the reason for this is contained not in coercion of social structures, but in the risk of losing something valuable (in a subjective sense). Individuals do not want to risk their "source of satisfaction", and consciously identify themselves with a group trying to maximize the measure of "group conformity". However, this cannot be considered as an exhaustive explanation which excludes all others. The author believes that it is impossible to synthesize a single consistent theory of identity, because in this case we would have to combine incompatible things.

Keywords: social identity, rational choice theory, social structure, individual, theories of identity

## References

- Aguiar F., Francisco A. (2008) *Can rational choice cope with identity?* Available at: <http://digital.csic.es/bitstream/10261/7758/1/conferenciafernando.pdf> (accessed 29.10.2011).
- Akerlof G.A., Kranton R.E. (2000) Economics and identity. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, vol. CXV, no 3, pp. 715–753.
- Barthes R. (1989) Smert' avtora [Death of the Author]. *Izbrannye raboty: Semiotika. Pojetika* [Selected Works: Semiotics. Poetics], Moscow: Progress, pp. 384–391.
- Becker G.S. (1992) *The economic way of looking at life*. Available at: <http://home.uchicago.edu/gbecker/Nobel/nobellecture.pdf> (accessed 15.12.2011).
- Berger P., Luckmann T. (1995) *Social'noe konstruirovaniye real'nosti: traktat po sociologii znanija* [The Social Construction of Reality: A Treatise in the Sociology of Knowledge], Moscow: Medium.
- Coleman J. (2002) Jekonomiceskaja sociologija s tochki zrenija teorii raciona'nogo vybora [A Rational Choice Perspective on Economic Sociology]. *Jekonomiceskaja sociologija*, vol. 5, no 3, pp. 35–44.
- Downs A. (1957) *An Economic Theory of Democracy*, New York: Harper and Row.
- Durkheim E. (1991) O razdelenii obshhestvennogo truda [On the Division of Social Labour]. *O razdelenii obshhestvennogo truda. Metod sociologii* [On the Division of Social Labour. Sociological Method], Moscow: Nauka, pp. 3–390.
- Durkheim E. (1995) Metod sociologii [Sociological Method]. *Sociologija: ejo predmet, metod, prednaznachenie* [Sociology: Its Subject, Method, Destination], Moscow: Kanon, pp. 7–158.

- Erickson E. (2006) *Identichnost': junost' i krizis* [Identity: Youth and Crisis], Moscow: Flinta, MPSI, Progress.
- Farmer M. (1994) *Racional'nyj vybor: teorija i praktika* [Rational Choice: Theory and Practice]. *Polis*, no 3, pp. 47–58.
- Ilyin I. (1996) *Poststrukturalizm. Dekonstruktivizm. Postmodernizm* [Poststructuralism. Deconstructivism. Postmodernism], Moscow: Intrada.
- Khabenskaya E. (2006) *Jetnicheskaja identichnost': podhody k probleme* [Ethnic Identity: Approches to the Problem]. *Bulleten Vladikavkazskogo instituta upravlenija*, no 20, pp. 57–81.
- Kultygin V. (2004) *Teoriya rational'nogo vbyora: vozniknovenie i sovremennoe sostojanie* [Rational Choice Theory: Emergence and Recent State]. *Sociologicheskie issledovaniya*, no 1, pp. 27–36.
- Kusainov A. (2003) *Francuzskaja "novaja filosofija" i kul'tura postmoderna* [French "New Philosophy" and Postmodern Culture], Volgograd: VolGU.
- Orlova E. (2010) *Koncepcii identifikacii/identichnosti: antropologicheskaja traktovka* [Conceptions of Identification/Identity: An Anthropological Perspective]. *Voprosy social'noj teorii*, vol. 4, pp. 87–111.
- Panov P. (2008) *Koncepcija soobshhestva i issledovanie politiki* [Conception of Community and Politics Study]. *Vestnik Permskogo universiteta: Serija "Politologija"*, no 2, pp. 19–30.
- Panov P. (2011) *Instituty, identichnosti, praktiki: teoreticheskaja model' politicheskogo porjadka* [Institutions, Identities, Practices: Theoretical Model of Political Order], Moscow: ROSSPEN.
- Parsons T. (1998) *Sistema sovremennoy obshhestv* [The System of Modern Societies], Moscow: Aspekt-Press.
- Petrucijova J. (2010) *Po sledam chelovecheskoj identichnosti* [In the Trace of Human Identity]. *Mysl*, vol. 10, pp. 103–112.
- Ritzer J. (2002) *Sovremennye sociologicheskie teorii* [Modern Sociological Theory], Saint-Petersburg: Piter.
- Schuessler A.A. (2000) Expressive voting. *Rationality and Society*, vol. 12, no 1, pp. 87–119.
- Simonova O. (2008) K formirovaniyu sociologii identichnosti [Toward the Emergence of the Sociology of Identity]. *Sociologicheskij zhurnal*, no 3, pp. 45–61.
- Tishkov V. (2001) *Jetnologija i politika. Nauchnaja publicistika* [Ethnology and Politics. Scientific Essays], Moscow: Nauka.
- Tsebelis J. (1997) V zashhitu teorii rational'nogo vbyora [In Defence of Rational Choice Theory]. *Sovremennaja sravnitel'naja politologija: khrestomatiya* [Handbook of Contemporary Political Science] (eds. G. Golosov, L. Galkina), Moscow: Moskovskij obshhestvennyj nauchnyj fond, pp. 52–83.
- Vignoles V.L., Schwartz S.J., Luyckx K. (2011) Introduction: toward an intergrative view of identity. *Handbook of Identity Theory and Research* (eds. S.J. Schwartz, K. Luyckx, V.L. Vignoles), New York: Springer, pp. 1–27.
- Vinogradenko G., Frolova I. (2011) Socializacija, internalizacija, identichnost': dialektika vzaimosvjazi [Socialization, Internalization, Identity: Dialectics of Relationship]. *Vestnik BashGU*, vol. 16, no 4, pp. 1389–1391.

## Video Socio

*Andrei Korbut*

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics  
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000  
E-mail: korbut.andrei@gmail.com

Review of *Video in Qualitative Research: Analysing Social Interaction in Everyday Life* by Christian Heath, Jon Hindmarsh and Paul Luff (London: SAGE, 2010).

## Содержание

Editor's Note.....	4
<i>Alexander Filippov</i>	

### POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY

The 17th-Century Political Cartesianism and Its Opponents, or, Imaging the State from Point Fixe.....	5
<i>Julia Ivanova, Pavel Sokolov</i>	

### RUSSIAN ATLANTIS

Russian Atlantis.....	25
<i>Andrey Teslya</i>	
"There Is No Chance to Understand What Russia Wants": Slavophile Press and Serbia in 1880s.....	27
<i>Александр Комов</i>	
The Censored Sixth Article by Ivan Aksakov from the Series "On the Mutual Relationship Between People, Society and State".....	41
<i>Andrey Teslya</i>	

### SCHMITTIANA

Glossarium.....	71
<i>Carl Schmitt</i>	

### TRANSLATIONS

Two Worlds of Action: Social Science, Social Theory and Systems of Sociological Refraction.....	75
<i>Phil Hutchinson</i>	

### ÉTUDES RICŒURIENNES

Narrative Identity as a Theory of Practical Subjectivity: An Essay on Reconstruction of Paul Ricoeur's Theory.....	100
<i>Jean-Marc Tétaz</i>	

### CULTURAL SOCIOLOGY

Cultural Sociology Against the Pharaoh: The "Performative Revolution" in Egypt.....	122
<i>Alexei Titkov</i>	

### ARTICLES AND ESSAYS

Social Identity: Rational Choice Theory as an Alternative Approach to Conceptualization.....	131
<i>Dmitry Davydov</i>	

**BOOK REVIEWS**

Video Socio..... <i>Andrei Korbut</i>	143
Abstracts.....	153